

Mail Stop Interference
P.O. Box 1450
Alexandria Va 22313-1450
Tel: 571-272-4683
Fax: 571-273-0042

Paper No. 150
Filed: March 31, 2009

UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE
BEFORE THE BOARD OF PATENT APPEALS
AND INTERFERENCES

ROBERT W. ESMOND, JACK R. WANDS
AND SUZANNE DE LA MONTE
Junior Party
(U.S. Patent Application 09/394,712),

v.

GARY LANDRETH, COLIN COMBS, JERRY SILVER,
AND MICHAEL T. FITCH
Senior Party
(U.S. Patent 6,191,154).

Patent Interference No. 105,601 (MPT)
(Technology Center 1600)

1 Judgment – Preliminary Motions – Bd. R. 127
2

3 Before: FRED E. McKELVEY, *Senior Administrative Patent Judge* and SALLY
4 GARDNER LANE and MICHAEL P. TIERNEY, *Administrative Patent Judges*.
5
6 TIERNEY, *Administrative Patent Judge*.
7

8 The Board has entered a Decision on Motions in this interference.
9 (Paper 149). The Decision grants Landreth Substantive Motion 2 for
10 judgment based on lack of written description. Unpatentability of all a
11 party's involved claims for lack of written description is a threshold issue

1 that deprives a party of standing in the interference. 37 C.F.R. § 41.201.

2 Accordingly, judgment is entered against junior party Esmond.

3 It is:

4 **Ordered** that judgment be entered against all of junior party

5 Esmond's involved claims, claims 23-24, 28-29, 31 and 33.

6 **Further Ordered** that claims 23-24, 28-29, 31 and 33 of Esmond's

7 involved U.S. Patent Application 09/394,712 be FINALLY REFUSED,

8 35 § U.S.C. 135(a).

9 **Further Ordered** that a copy of this judgment be entered in the

10 administrative records of the involved Esmond U.S. Patent Application

11 09/394,712 and Landreth U.S. Patent 6,191,154.

1 cc (via electronic filing):
2

3 Counsel for Landreth:
4

5 George E. Quillin, Esq.
6

7 Anthony H. Son, Esq.
8

9 **FOLEY & LARDNER LLP**
10

11 3000 K Street, NW
12

13 Suite 500
14

15 Washington, DC 20007-5109
16

17 Tel: 202-672-5413
18

19 Fax: 216-621-4072
20

21 Email: gquillin@foley.com
22

23 Email: ason@foley.com
24

25 Richard Sutkus
26

27 **TAROLLI, SUNDHEIM, COVELL & TUMMINO, LLP**
28

29 1300 East Ninth Street
30

31 Suite 1700
32

33 Cleveland, OH 44114
34

35 Tel: 216-621-2234
36

37 Fax: 216-621-4072
38

39 Email: rsutkus@tarolli.com
40

41 Counsel for Esmond:
42

43 Lawrence M. Green, Esq.
44

45 **WOLF, GREENFIELD & SACKS, PC**
46

47 600 Atlantic Avenue
48

49 Boston, MA 02210
50

51 Tel: 614-646-8000
52

53 Fax: 617-646-8646
54

55 Email: PAT-LawrenceGreen@WolfGreenfield.com
56

57 Email: PAT-MichaelSiekman@WolfGreenfield.com
58